

THE COUNTY GOVERNMENT OF KITUI



THE COUNTY ASSEMBLY SECOND ASSEMBLY- SECOND SESSION

COMMITTEE ON LABOUR AND SOCIAL WELFARE

REPORT ON ASSESMENT OF THE KITUI COUNTY HEALTH WORKERS WELFARE

“As at 22nd November 2018”.

Clerks Chambers,
County assembly Buildings,
Kitui Kenya

November, 2018

1.0 PREFACE

Mr. Speaker

Mr. Speaker, on behalf of the County Assembly Select Committee on Labour and Social Welfare, it is my pleasant duty and honour to present to this Honourable House the Committee's report on the Kitui County Health workers welfare assessment exercise which was conducted between 19th to 22nd November, 2018.

1.1 COMMITTEE MEMBERSHIP

Mr. Speaker

The County Assembly Committee on Labour and social welfare as currently constituted is composed of the following Honourable Members.

- | | |
|-----------------------------|------------------|
| 1. Hon. Munyoki Mwinzi | Chairperson |
| 2. Hon. Regina Ishmail | Vice Chairperson |
| 3. Hon. David Munyao Masaku | Member |
| 4. Hon. Anthony Ndo | Member |
| 5. Hon. Charles Maema | Member |
| 6. Hon. Munira Muhammed | Member |
| 7. Hon. Anthony Mbiti | Member |
| 8. Hon. Stephene Katana | Member |
| 9. Hon. Josphine Kavivi | Member |
| 10. Hon. Nicholas Mwalali | Member |
| 11. Hon. Boniface Kasina | Member |

1.2 COMMITTEE ESTABLISHMENT

Mr. Speaker,

The Committee on labour and social welfare is established under standing Order 190(1) of the Kitui County Assembly Standing Orders.

Pursuant to the Standing Order no 190(5), the Committee has the following mandates-

- i. Investigate, inquire into and report on all matters relating to the mandate, management, activities, administration, operation and estimates of the assigned departments;
- ii. Study programmes and policy objectives of departments and the effectiveness of the Implementation;
- iii. Study and review all County Legislations referred to it;
- iv. Study, assess and analyse the relative success of departments as measured by the results obtained as compared with their stated objectives
- v. Investigate and inquire all matters relating to the assigned departments as they may deem necessary, and as may be referred to them by the County Assembly;
- vi. To vet and report on all appointments where the constitution or any law requires the County Assembly to approve, except those under Standing Order 185(Committee on Appointments) and;
- vii. Make reports and recommendations to the County Assembly as often as possible, including recommendations of proposed legislation.

The second schedule of the Standing Orders requires the Committee to consider all matters relating to labour, trade union relations, manpower or human resource planning, gender, and social welfare.

BACKGROUND

Mr. Speaker

The Committee during a sitting held on Thursday 25th October 2018, vide Min (LSWC) 109/2018 members noted with a lot of concern that there has been a continuous public outcry on health workers on their welfare, including on-

- i. Lack of promotions despite being qualified and due for promotions leading to low morale and resignations
- ii. Low staffing ratios resulting in overworking and lack of off duties to undertake personal matters.
- iii. Allegations of some health workers being unqualified for their positions ;
- iv. Casuals working for long periods without pay
- v. Un equal payments to casuals
- vi. Adherence to the minimum wage in payment of casuals

The Committee resolved to undertake a fact finding mission to ascertain the veracity of these allegations and ensure that the welfare of workers is protected

Mr. Speaker,

Between 19th to 22nd November 2018, the Committee conducted a random County health workers assessment exercise at various health facilities and thereafter retreated to Mwingi summer springs Hotel between 23rd and 24 November 2018 for report writing.

During the exercise, the Committee visited the following health facilities;

1. Katulani Dispensary,
2. Mutomo Level IV Hospital,
3. Mbitini Health Centre,
4. Kitui Level IV hospital
5. Kyuso Level IV hospital and
6. Mwingi Level IV hospital.

Mr. Speaker,

The Committee now reports the status, and conditions of those facilities as at 22nd November 2018.

1.5 ACKNOWLEDGEMENT.

Mr Speaker

The Committee is grateful to the Offices of the Speaker and that of the Clerk of Assembly for the support extended to it in facilitating the production of this report.

I also wish to extend my appreciations to the Members of the Committee and the Staff of the County Assembly who worked tirelessly to compile this report.

Mr. Speaker

I wish to confirm that the recommendations and the resolutions of this committee were unanimous. It is therefore my pleasant duty and privilege, on behalf of the Committee on Labour and Social welfare to table this report to the House for consideration and consequent approval.

SIGNED BY _____

HON. MUNYOKI MWINZI (M.C.A).

CHAIRPERSON, COMMITTEE ON LABOUR AND SOCIAL WELFAIR

COUNTY ASSEMBLY OF KITUI

3.0. OVERVIEW OF THE COMMITTEE ASSESSMENT EXERCISE

Mr. Speaker,

The Committee commenced its assessment exercise on the health workers welfare on 19th November, 2018 and concluded the same on 22nd November 2018.

1. ASSESSMENT EXERCISE AT KATULANI LEVEL IV HOSPITAL

Mr. Speaker,

The Committee during a visit to the facility managed to meet with the Hospital Administrator one Mrs. Fauza Musembi who guided the members through the departments in the facility while conducting the exercise about health workers welfare.

The Committee was informed that the facility is run by the 14 departments both Clinical and non-clinical. The Committee identified the following departments which faces major challenges during their daily operations

i. Nutrition Department

Information from the Head of department.

Mr Speaker

Upon visiting this department, the committee managed to meet with the Officer in Charge one Miss Bridget Mutua a nutritionist, who gave the committee the following information

- a. The Committee was informed that the department is run by one officer who works daily with no off duties since she has no reliever.
- b. The Officer, also informed the Committee that apart from working as nutritionist, she is also attached to Comprehensive Care Unit (C.C.C), outpatient Department (O.P.D) and in general wards, during this time, the nutrition department remains closed.
- c. The officer informed the committee that the multitasking in different departments results in working for long hours without payments of the time extended.

ii. Nursing & laboratory Departments

Information by departmental Heads

Mr. Speaker

Upon meeting the departmental Heads of the two departments at the same time, the Committee was able to get the following information;

- a. The Committee was informed that the departments are characterised by low staffing ratios as the nursing department is run by ten nurses while the laboratory department is served by only one lab technician.

- b. The Committee was informed that the available nurses are attached to all fourteen departments within the facility and ends up working for very long hours due to large number of duty assignments which must be completed at the appropriate time.
- c. The Committee was informed that as a result of understaffing in the said departments, the concerned staff have not been subjected to annual leaves as required and they rarely get off duties to undertake their personal matters.
- d. The Committee was further informed that at least twenty one (21) nurses and four (4) lab technicians are required in order for the departments to work efficiently and effectively.

iii. Medical Social Worker Department

Information by Mwanaija Hassan (Medical Social worker)

Mr. Speaker,

As regards this department, the Committee was informed that;

- a. The department is served by one officer who is a medical social worker.
- b. The officer informed the Committee that she has never been subjected to her annual leave nor does she get any off duty even upon applying for the same.
- c. The Committee was further informed that the Officer has never been subjected to any training relevant to her job description and she has never been promoted to the next job group despite being due for promotion.

STATUS OF CASUAL WORKERS

Mr. Speaker,

The Committee was informed that the facility has ten (10) casual workers who serve in three month contract basis and two (2) others seconded to the facility by the County Public Service Board.

The need for contracting the casual workers is to offer support services to the health workers staff and engage in daily errands as may be required by the facility from time to time.

The Committee was informed that four of the casuals are form four leavers, two are diploma holders, three have certificates in computer applications and only one has Kenya Certificate of Primary Education (K.C.P.E.).

Adherence to Minimum Wage.

Mr. Speaker.

The Committee was informed that casuals contracted by the facility receive a maximum wage of between Kshs.8, 000 to Kshs.10, 000 depending on their level of education while those seconded to the facility through the County Public Service board receives a minimum pay of Kshs.21, 000.

2. ASSESMENT EXERCISE AT MUTOMO LEVEL IV HOSPITAL

Mr. Speaker

During a visit at Mutomo Level IV hospital, the Committee met with the hospital medical superintendent one Mr. Martin Nkulet who guided the Members in different departments within the facility.

Upon short briefings by the Chairperson on the Committee's need to visit the facility, the Committee was informed that Mutomo hospital falls far much below the standards of a level four Hospital.

The Committee was informed that the facility is served by ten departments most of which are not functional due to low staffing and/or served by staff who are not employed to work under such departments.

The Committee being concerned about the status of the facility, managed to visit the following departments-

i. Comprehensive Care Clinic (C.C.C) Department

Mr. Speaker

This department is responsible for offering a comprehensive care to expectant mothers who are HIV+ as well as ensuring that children born by such mothers do not turn positive as they grow.

Upon visiting this department, the Committee discovered that there was no officer at the moment responsible for undertaking the duties at the care unit due to resignation of the officers attached to the department from the facility.

The Committee was informed that the department has remained un functional for quite a long time since no officer has been posted to the facility to take over duties in the C.C.C department.

ii. Radiology Department

Mr. Speaker

This department is responsible for diagnosing and treating disease and injury through the use of medical imaging techniques such as x-rays, computed tomography (CT), fusion imaging and ultra sound.

Mr. Speaker

Upon visiting this department, the Committee was informed that the facility had received one radiologist to work in the department but unfortunately the officer resigned immediately, due to lack of machines and other equipment which are necessary for

carrying on radiography. Owing to this fact, the department has remained dormant in the facility.

iii. **Nursing Department**

Mr. Speaker

The nursing department in a health facility is crucial as the nurses plays important prevention roles across all settings including inpatient, outpatient, and home health care.

Mr. Speaker,

The Committee was informed that Mutomo Level four hospital is served by eight (8) nurses who are distributed to all departments

The Committee was further informed that a total of at least twenty eight nurses are needed in order for the facility to provide a quality health care and to avoid the situations of overstretching available nurses.

iv. **Inpatient Department**

Mr. Speaker,

The inpatient department is responsible for the care of patients whose conditions requires admissions to the hospitals.

Mr Speaker

During the assessment exercise, the committee discovered that Mutomo Level IV hospital does not have an inpatient department.

The Committee was informed that failure to have the department in practise has been occasioned by the following factors;

- a.) Lack of pit latrines for staff and patients
- b.) Lack of placenta pit
- c.) Lack of septic tank and sewerage system construction
- d.) Lack of Kitchen
- e.) Lack of water and water storage tanks for use by the facility

The committee was further informed that the facility needs a storied outpatient with a minimum of 36 rooms for various departments such as casualty, cashier, labs, radiology, OPD, Pharmacy, physiotherapy, PITC, CCC, offices, records ,store, minor theatre injection rooms, call rooms and clinics

STATUS OF CASUAL WORKERS.

The Committee was informed that the facility has four casual workers who have been assigned duties as a secretary, cleaner, compound attendant and mortuary attendant.

The facility having been upgraded to a level four hospital, all the casuals are forced to work tirelessly for the best service delivery going to a point of working all day and night.

The Committee was informed that there is no adjustment of payments for the time extended while undertaking the extra duties

Adherence to the Minimum Wage

Mr. Speaker

The casual workers serve in the facility for a period of three months in contract basis which is subject to renewal for another period of three months.

The Casuals are paid from the proceeds generated by the facility as follows;

- a.) Secretary- Kshs. 12,000
- b.) Mortuary attendant Kshs. 10,000
- c.) Cleaner - Kshs. 8,000
- d.) Compound attendant- Kshs. 7,000

The Committee was informed that it has not been possible for the facility to adhere to minimum wage rates when paying the casuals due to lack of sufficient funds to run the facility.

3. ASSESMENT EXERCISE AT MBITINI HEALTH CENTRE

Mr. Speaker,

During a visit to Mbitini health centre, the Committee managed to meet the Officer in Charge of the facility who received the members and took them to some of the areas of their concern.

The Committee was informed that the facility is served by seven departments all of which are fully functional.

The departments that supports the facility include the following;

- a.) Customer care,
- b.) Full outpatient
- c.) Laboratory
- d.) Maternity
- e.) Pharmacy
- f.) Dressing and injection
- g.) Clinical and,
- h.) Comprehensive care clinic (C. C. C)

- i.) The Committee upon visiting whole facility was impressed to note that all departments were equipped with the modern facilities, tools of work, and had observed high standards of cleanliness, making the environment pleasant and necessary for patients who seek health services at Mbitini health centre. The committee commended the administration of the facility for their good work and classified the same as a ultra-modern health centre within Kitui county.

STAFFING

The administration informed the Committee that the facility has fourteen (14) members of staff, who were all promoted to the next job group in the year 2018.

STATUS OF CAUSUAL WORKERS

Mr. Speaker

The Committee was informed that the facility is served by five (5) casual workers, four of them under the facility while only one has been sent by the county government.

CHALLENGES

Mr. Speaker

The nursing officer in charge of the facility together with the Hospital administration informed the Committee that at some instances, the smooth running of the hospital is interfered with when unknown person who only identify themselves as coming from the office of the governor visit the facility and demands to know how staff work.

The Committee was further informed that at some point those who visit the facility with such demands identify themselves as community mobilizers from the office of the governor.

The facility administration reported the incident to the Sub county administrator and no action has ever been taken.

4. ASSESMENT EXERCISE AT KYUSO LEVEL IV HOSPITAL

Mr. Speaker

Upon visiting Kyuso level IV hospital the Committee was received by Dr. Oweri, and Ms Felista Ototo, the Deputy nursing Officer.

The Committee was informed that the facility was named a Level IV hospital despite the fact that it falls far much below the standards of a level IV hospital.

Being a level Hospital, the facility lacks crucial departments like inpatient, and it is served by only one doctor, as opposed to ten (10) doctors, which is the minimum number of the doctors required in a level IV hospital. Owing to this fact, it has been difficult for the facility to carry out night duties and offer effective health services as the only doctor available in

the facility is also the doctor in charge of all nineteen dispensaries in Mwingi North Sub County.

Mr. Speaker,

The two officers informed the Committee that although the facility has Nine (9) departments, all of them are not functioning effectively and efficiently due to low staffing and /or no staff deployed to the department.

The departments established to serve the facility are,

- a.) Nursing
- b.) Laboratory
- c.) Wards
- d.) Pharmacy
- e.) Outpatient
- f.) MCH & family planning
- g.) Maternity
- h.) Records and,
- i.) Public Health.

The committee was informed that all the above mentioned departments don't have enough officers due to resignation of those who had earlier been appointed to work in the affected departments.

The officers informed the Committee that those who had recently resigned from the facility by that time were;

- 1.) One Clinical Officer
- 2.) One Dentist
- 3.) One Radiologist and,
- 4.) X-ray specialised

All of them grounded their resignation due to poor working conditions, Insecurity, and over working due to low staffing among other reasons.

Staff promotions

The Committee was informed that none of the staff has been promoted for over ten (10) years.

Status of casual workers

The facility is served by 18 by Eighteen (18) casual workers fifteen (15) employed by the facility while three (3) of them seconded by the County Government.

Adherence to minimum wage

The Committee was informed that it has been difficulty for the facility to adhere to minimum wage rates when paying the casuals due to lack of sufficient funds to run the hospital.

All the casuals' workers are paid a standard rate of Kshs.8, 330. (**Eight thousand three Hundred and Thirty**)

5. OVERSIGHT EXERCISE AT KITUI LEVEL IV HOSPITAL

Mr, Speaker,

The Kitui Level IV is the biggest health facility in the County.

The Committee during a visit to the facility managed to meet Doctor Mugnai, the medical superintendent who briefed the members on the management and status of the general hospital.

The Hospital Management

The committee was informed that the facility is managed through hospital Committees in consultation with the Chief Officer, County Ministry of health and sanitation.

The following Committees were noted for playing key roles in the hospital management and administration

i. Hospital Management Committee

(Responsible for oversight and representing the community interest in the health planning)

ii. Executive Expenditure Committee

(Responsible for preparing estimates of annual cost sharing of revenue)

iii. Hospital management Committee

(Responsible for preparing expenditure plans based on revenue estimates taking into account the priorities)

iv. Departmental Committees

(Responsible for discussing new developments in patient care and current health progress)

Mr. Speaker

The medical superintendent for the general hospital described the facility as progressing well in terms of staff management and human resource are concerned.

The Committee being impressed by the steps taken in the facility towards ensuring a quality health care is realised by the people, visited the following clinical departments

1. The nursing department

Upon visiting this department, the Committee was impressed to find that the department is run by one hundred and thirty (130) nurses being an improvement from last year when it was served by 86 nurses.

The Committee was informed that the nurses are distributed to assist the doctors in all wards during day and night shifts.

2. Radiology department

In this department, the Committee managed to meet Mr. Thaddus Otieno, a radiologist who confirmed the operations of the department are satisfactory in terms of staffing, departmental equipment and working environment

3. Orthopaedic, Trauma & plaster room

Mr. Speaker,

The Committee being guided by the medical superintendent visited this department where members managed to speak to Mr. Mbithi Mutua.

The Committee was informed that the department has enough staff to run its affairs, and with addition of the support staff attached to the department, Mr. Mutua confirmed the operations of the department as satisfactory.

4. Pharmacy Department

Mr. Speaker,

It is important to note that the primary role of a pharmacy in a modern hospital is to manage the use of medications in hospitals and other medical centres. Goals include the selection, prescription, procurement, delivery, administration and review of medications to optimize patient outcome.

The department is also important to ensure that the right patient, dose, route of administration, time, drug, information and documentation are respected when any medication is used.

Mr. Speaker,

Upon visiting this department, the Committee was informed that the crucial department is severely understaffed and the same faces a continuous challenge of lack of enough drugs.

The Committee was further informed that the introduction of Kitui County Health Insurance Cover (KCHIC) has triggered many patients visiting the Level IV hospital and demanding to be treated in a particular manner and also insists to be prescribed with the drugs of their choice.

Some of those who visit the facility and demand for treatment and prescription of certain drugs have genuine health complications while others have no symptoms or signs of any illness at all.

6. OVERSIGHT AT MWINGI LEVEL IV HOSPITAL

Mr. Speaker,

Mwingi level Iv Hospital is the second largest health facility in Kitui County after Kitui General Hospital.

Upon Visit to the said Hospital the Committee was received by the deputy nursing Officer in charge of the facility one Jane Munya.

The Committee was informed that the facility is served by nine (9) wards which includes;

- i. Maternity
- ii. Surgical
- iii. General ward
- iv. Eye
- v. Paediatric ward.
- vi. Comprehensive care clinic (C.C.C)
- vii. Theatre
- viii. High depenancy and
- ix. Outpatient

Other departments includes Skin and Chest, and mother and Child health care.

The facility has a projected population of 2,874 patients however, this population is just for basic services. For Compressive services it serves a population of two sub counties namely Mwingi North and Mwingi west to an extend of serving Kitui County.

The hospital offers both preventive and curative services ranging from basic health care to comprehensive health care. It offers referrals from other small facilities and refers its patients to Kenyatta National Hospital.

Mr. Speaker

The deputy nursing Officer confirmed to the Committee that the services offered by the facility through the departments mentioned above are satisfactory save for the shortage of the doctors.

STAFF PROMOTIONS

The Committee was informed that the promotions are not evenly distributed to all members of the staff.

THE KITUI COUNTY HEALTH INSURANCE COVER (KCHIC)

Mr. Speaker,

The Committee was informed that the introduction of the Kitui County Health Insurance cover (KCHIC) has increased the work load in all departments within the facility.

The committee was informed that such increment in work load has been attributed to free medications to patients who visit the hospital.

The Committee was further informed that before the introduction of the KCHIC, patients had stayed at their homes for long periods with minor illness without visiting the facility.

Mr. Speaker,

After establishing the said facts health workers in different health facilities, the Committee resolved to invite the Chief Officer from the County Ministry of Health and sanitation to clarify the facts so collected.

The Chief Officer was to appear before the joint Committee on Labour and social welfare together with the Committee on Health and sanitation on 30th July 2019.

Mr. Speaker,

It is regrettable to inform this Assembly that upon inviting the Chief Officer to appear personally before the Committee to help the committee with the necessary information to finalise this report, the said officer did not appear before the Committee on the date and time so requested.

The Chief Officer instead send the following officers, to appear on his behalf;

1. Dr. Owino- County Director of Health
2. Mr. Alex Muthyoi – Ag. Manager KCHIC.

MEETING WITH THE COUNTY DIRECTOR OF HEALTH AND THE ACTING MANAGER, KCHIC ON BEHALF OF THE CHIEF OFFICER, COUNTY MINISTRY OF HEALTH

Mr. Speaker,

Upon meeting with the two officers, the Committee was able to gather the following information;

1. **Lack of promotions despite being qualified and due for promotions leading to low morale and resignation**
2. Upon enquiring about this fact, the Committee was informed that the County is not using the performance based programme in promoting the county staff. The same is done through collective bargaining agreement.

The Committee was further informed that it is the duty of the County Public service Board to deal with the issue of promotions.

The Committee was informed that currently, one hundred and sixty seven (167) members of the staff have been promoted to the next job group out of one Hundred and eighty (180) who had applied for promotion leaving only thirteen (13) applicants. However no proof was produced to justify this fact.

3. Low staffing ratios resulting in over working and lack of off duties to undertake personal matters

The Committee was informed that low staffing for the County Health workers is experienced everywhere not only in Kitui County, but also across the country. The Committee was further informed that in order to mitigate the effect of low staffing in our county, the County Ministry of Health has set aside seven Hundred Million(Khs.700,000,000) for the purposes of hiring more doctors and nurses.

4. Allegations of some health workers being unqualified for their positions.

The officers informed the Committee that they are not aware of the said allegations and further informed and further added that such prove can only be evidenced by the County public service Board.

5. Un equal payments to casuals

As regards payments to the casuals, the Committee was informed that Ministry of health is using guidelines ranging from skilled, unskilled and in case the engagement is done to a specialised, then there is an agreement on how a person is willing to take.

The Committee was informed that there is no unequal pay made to the casuals.

COMMITTEE OBSERVATIONS AND FINDINGS

As regards to the inspection, the committee made the following general observations:

1. The Committee observed that the newly upgraded level (IV) four hospitals falls below the standards, since the facilities lacks equipment and other essential amenities required for them to operate as such.
2. The Committee observed that there is severe shortage of doctors, nurses and Health record officers in all hospitals, and health centres across the County.
3. The Committee observed that about Eighty per centum(80%) of the staff working in health facilities have not been promoted for the last ten(10) years
4. The Committee observed that the beneficiaries of the Kitui County Health Insurance Cover (KCHIC) have not been clearly familiarised with operation of the programme.

5. The Committee observed that at some instances, the smooth running of the facility was interrupted when the community mobilizers visit the facilities with demands on how the health workers carry their duties within the facility.
6. The Committee observed that some facilities don't adhere to minimum wages when paying the casuals.
7. The Committee found that some officers had resigned from their duties due to insecurity as at that time

COMMITTEE RESOLUTIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

- The Committee recommends that the County government through the ministry of Health and sanitation do ensure that health facilities which have been upgraded to a level Iv Hospitals be fully equipped with the necessary working equipment to enable them offer a quality health care to the residents
- The Committee recommends that the County Public service Board (KPSB) should employ additional nurses, Health record Officers, Doctors and other medical health practitioners to be distributed across all health facilities in the County.
- The Committee recommends that it will carry out a separate and comprehensive inquiry, about the issues of promotion and allegations of unqualified workers and further do separate reporting of the same to the assembly.
- The County government through its representatives to sensitize members of the public about the working of the Kitui County Health Insurance Cover (KCHIC) for the purpose of creating an awareness on its operation.
- The County government through the Ministry of health to improve the working conditions of health workers to reduce chances of resignations.
- The County government to ensure the adherence to minimum wage when paying the casuals.

CONCLUSION

In conclusions the committee was impressed by the cooperation of the administrators and the staff of all the health facilities during the time of assessment.

.Mr. Speaker

The Committee requests THAT;

This House adopts the Report by the Committee on labour and social welfare on assessment of the Kitui County Health workers welfare.

We the Members of Labour and Social Welfare Committee hereby append our signatures to authenticate and adopt the report on Inspection of the Kitui County Health Workers Welfare.

NAME

- | | | |
|------------------------------|---|-----------------------|
| 1. Hon. Munyoki Mwinzi | - | Chairperson ----- |
| 2. Hon. Regina Mueni Ishmail | | Vice Chairperson----- |
| 3. Hon. David Masaku | | Member----- |
| 4. Hon. Anthony Ndo | | Member----- |
| 5. Hon. Charles Maema | | Member----- |
| 6. Hon. Munira Muhamed | | Member----- |
| 7. Hon. Anthony Mbiti | | Member----- |
| 8. Hon. Stephene Katana | | Member----- |
| 9. Hon. Josphine Kavivi | | Member----- |
| 10.Hon. Nicholas Mwalali | | Member----- |
| 11. Hon. Boniface Kasina | | Member----- |